

# DRAFT

## MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF CHULA VISTA

July 19, 2017

4:00 p.m.

A regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Chula Vista was called to order at 4:00 p.m. in Council Chambers, Building "A" located at 276 Fourth Avenue, Chula Vista, California.

### ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Chair Fink, Commissioners Fotiadi, O'Neill, Schoenherr, and Orso

ABSENT: None

ALSO PRESENT: Project Manager Michael Walker and Secretary Rice

### CONSENT CALENDAR

1. Declaration of excused/unexcused absences Julie Danielson and Mario Orso June 29, 2016 Special Meeting.

Staff Recommendation  
HPC Excuse the absence

Action: Commissioner O'Neill made a motion to excuse the absences. Commissioner Fotiadi seconded and it carried 4-0-1-0 with Commissioner Orso abstaining.

2. Approval of minutes for June 29, 2016

Staff recommendation  
HPC approve the minutes

Action: Commissioner Schoenherr made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner Fotiadi seconded and it carried 5-0.

### PUBLIC COMMENTS

There were none.

### PUBLIC HEARINGS

3. Consideration to delist the property, 50 F Street, known as the Herman Hotel Carriage house, Site #17 from its historical designation.

# DRAFT

Michael Walker, Project Manager stated the applicant, Victor Marmolejo, is requesting to delist his property from its historical resource designation, located 50 F Street. The property is also known as the Herman Hotel Carriage House, is currently classified as a historical resource, and identified by the 1985 Historical Resources Inventory as Local Historic Site #17. The delisting will allow the applicant to demolish the Carriage House and build a new single-family dwelling and detached garage. Mr. Marmolejo submitted a Major Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) application request for Delisting as required by the Historic Preservation Ordinance.

Staff gave a power point presentation which included photos of the property

Development Services staff has reviewed the proposed delisting project for compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and has determined that the Carriage House, although originally designated as a local historical resource, no longer meets the eligibility criteria for a historical resource. New evidence demonstrates the Carriage House's integrity has diminished, and that it was designated inaccurately as substantial alterations had changed its appearance, and it no longer physically conveys a historical significance. Furthermore, the Chula Vista Building Official and Fire Marshall have determined the building is unsafe and a potential threat to public safety. Therefore, the project is not subject to CEQA Section 21084.1, and is therefore exempt from review pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15301(I)(1) Existing Facilities (Demolition of Small Structures); no further CEQA review is required.

Commissioner O'Neil commented he had visited the site when it was in foreclosure, before it was bought by the applicant, and the house was built on dirt. There was no foundation and it had very little of its original architectural elements left. The structure in its current state was a safety hazard.

Commissioner Fotiadi concurred with Commissioner O'Neill from looking at the photos there was no foundation and the structure was not safe.

Commissioner Orso agreed with his colleagues that the structure was not sound and there was little historic value left. However, he had questions regarding the staff report and it's finding that it was not subject to CEQA Section 21084.1 and exempt from review pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15301(I)(1) Existing Facilities (Demolition of Small Structures). He understood the structure was a safety hazard but it is still considered an historical resource until it is taken off the historical resource list by the agency that designated it. There could not be a categorical exclusion if it was deemed a historical resource. He wanted to ensure that proper procedures were taken to delist the property.

Chair Fink asked staff to address Commissioner Orso's concerns.

# DRAFT

Mr. Walker explained the Carriage House was originally designated because of its association with the Hermon Hotel. The Carriage House was not conveyed adequately in 1987, as its association with the Hermon Hotel was lost after the hotel was destroyed and never rebuilt; the Carriage House is the only remaining remnant of the hotel complex. The Historical Resource Analysis Report (HRPR) found that the Carriage House's historical integrity had diminished prior to the 1987 historical designation, and it does not convey the 1894-1914 period of significance. In addition, it does not meet the local or state criteria for historic resource eligibility.

The following text from the City's Historical Preservation Ordinance provides the required findings for the Historic Preservation Commission's delisting determination and recommendation to City Council.

## Delisting

*21.050.040 Historical resource delisting- Findings of fact.*

*Delisting of a historical resource shall be discouraged unless it is substantiated through an expert technical analysis that one or more of the following findings of fact exist:*

- New evidence provided demonstrates that previously identified historical significance of historical resource has been reduced or no longer exists such that the resource no longer meets the eligibility criteria;*
- The resource was designated inaccurately based on incorrect information;*
- The integrity of the historical resource or the resource itself has been greatly diminished such that it no longer physically conveys it's identified historical significance resultant from extensive unintentional damage, fire, flood, or natural disaster.*

Public Comments

None

Public Hearing Open

Public Hearing Closed

Action: Commissioner O'Neill made the motion to recommend that the City Council approve a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Permit COA16-0007 request to delist the Herman Hotel Carriage House Site #17. Commissioner Schoenherr seconded motion and it carried unanimously 5-0.

# DRAFT

## ACTION ITEMS

4. Election of new Chair and Vice Chair for FYE 2017-18

A motion was made by Chair Fink to elect Commissioner Schoenherr as Chairperson and Commissioner O'Neill as Vice Chair both candidates accepted. The commission unanimously voted 5-0 to elect the new officers.

## OTHER BUSINESS

5. STAFF COMMENTS

6. CHAIR'S COMMENTS- None

7. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

Commissioner Orso asked if staff was planning on bringing back for discussion the Bed and Breakfast Ordinance.

Staff said they would be looking into that and would like to have a workshop

**ADJOURNMENT** at 4:25 p.m. to the regular meeting on August 2, 2017 in the Council Chambers, Building "A" at 276 Fourth Avenue, Chula Vista, California

---

Rosemarie Rice, Secretary