

Draft

MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF CHULA VISTA

December 4, 2013

4 p.m.

A Regular Meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Chula Vista was called to order at 4 p.m. in Council Chambers, Building "A" located at 276 Fourth Avenue, Chula Vista, California.

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Commissioners Danielson, Fotiadi, Fink, O'Neill (4:10 pm), Schoenherr, and Chair Stillman

ABSENT: None

ALSO PRESENT: Associate Planner Tessitore-Lopez, Principal Planner Pongeggi, City Attorney Shirey and Secretary Rice

CONSENT CALENDAR

1. Declaration of excused/unexcused absenteeism
None

ITEMS REMOVED FROM THE CONSENT CALENDAR

There were none.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

There were none.

ACTION ITEMS

2. Consideration of the Historical Eligibility of the Sears Building located at 565 Broadway.

Staff recommendation: Commission consider information provided in the City's 2011 survey and ASM's re-evaluation report for the Sears building located at 565 Broadway and the Technical Expert Analysis Report prepared by Heritage Architecture for the Sears building and take no further action.

Associate Planner Lopez stated the Sears building located at 565 Broadway was identified as an Eligible Historical Resource as part of the city's 2012 Historical Resources Survey. Subsequent to the survey, the property owner has requested reconsideration of the survey's finding of Eligibility. Shannon Davis, ASM's Senior Architectural Historian went over ASM's re-evaluation of their original report comparing it with the new information in Heritage's Expert

Draft

Technical Analysis (ETA). They continued to stand behind their original recommendation that the Sears building is eligible under Criterion 1; for the association of the commercial development of the City of Chula Vista during its maturation period, and Criterion 3; that it is eligible because of its significant style of architecture “modernism” and that it was designed by master architects Stiles and Robert Clements.

David Marshall, Architect with Heritage Architecture & Planning gave a presentation reviewing their ETA and its findings. In their opinion, one of the main reasons that it did not meet the eligibility requirements was due to past renovations of the Sears building had compromised the features that once characterized its style and the work of the master architects.

After listening to the presentation the commission deliberated on whether the building still met the Criterion to remain on the Historical Resources Eligibility list. There was some debate on whether through renovations that were done if the architectural features had been deviated. It was acknowledged that the building may have lost some of the original materials but others were covered up by past renovations and could be restored. Overall it was the general consensus of the commission that the Sears building still retained much of its design integrity through form, scale and massing.

Commissioner Schoenherr moved to take the Sears building off the Historical Resources Eligibility list and Commissioner O’Neill seconded the motion and it failed by the following vote.

No: 4- Danielson, Fotiadi, Fink, and Stillman. Since the motion failed no action was taken on the part of the HPC and the Sear’s status as an Eligible Resource will remain.

OTHER BUSINESS

STAFF COMMENTS

Associate Planner Lopez reminded the commission of the Brown Act and Ethics training taking place Thursday, December 5th. For more details concerning time and location she referred them to the HPC secretary.

3. CHAIR’S COMMENTS

None

4. COMMISSIONERS’/BOARD MEMBERS’ COMMENTS

Commissioner Fotiadi thanked staff and the presenters for an informative presentation.

Draft

ADJOURNMENT

At 5:17 p.m., Chairperson Stillman adjourned the meeting to the next Regular Meeting on January 15, 2014 in the Council Chambers, Building “A”, 276 Fourth Avenue, Chula Vista, California.

Rosemarie Rice, Secretary

Draft