

# Why Chula Vista Needs to **STOP** and **LISTEN** and **ENGAGE**

April 20, 2021

STOP Chula Vista PD Surveillance Ad Hoc Group



# Who ARE we?

- OVER 25 grassroots, community-based, faith-based, civil and immigrant rights org's
  - ACCE
  - ACLU
  - AFSC
  - South Bay People Power
  - etc.
- HUNDREDS of concerned Chula Vista residents, workers and visitors
- INCLUDING community members often targeted by surveillance and over-policing (immigrants, LGBTQ, people of color, etc.)

# Why are we calling for you to STOP and LISTEN?

- Unchecked surveillance technology poses a threat to our safety and civil rights
- Chula Vista should be a leader in protecting its Welcoming City
  - 2017: Council vote to join Welcoming America
  - 2019: First in CA to earn designation as a Certified Welcoming City
  - Awarded to local governments that meet the rigorous Welcoming Standard requirements for immigrant inclusion.
  - Calls for a higher standard to provide:
    - Accountability
    - Public access
    - Systems of inclusion

# How have we tried to engage with you?

- Dec 8, 2020: Over 30 community members submitted eComments opposed to ALPR surveillance
- Dec 17, 2020: CPRA request for details about the ALPR program and contacts
- Dec 18, 2020: Letter to Mayor & Council signed by over 20 org's plus numerous concerned community members
- Jan 4, 2021: Over 40 community members submitted eComments in opposition
- Mar 22: Letter to City Attorney and City Manager signed by 25 org's and over 50 concerned community members
- Mar 23: nearly 60 eComments, emails, letters in opposition to ALPR
- April 7: Tried to speak at police forum but technology was not community-friendly
- April 12: Small group met with Mayor
- April 14: 70 eComments and emails submitted in opposition to ALPR

# What have we heard back from you?

- Public statements by city officials that have **misrepresented and often miscounted** the number of eComments submitted in opposition to ALPR
- Partial but delayed groups of documents in response to our CPRA requests
- Mar 19: a **5-sentence email reply** (after resending our ad hoc group Dec 18 letter to the Mayor)
- **To date: No acknowledgement** or reply to our ad hoc group letter sent Mar 22

# How have the CVPD and the City as a whole failed to Self-Regulate to protect ALL community members?

- Data sharing - Was not understood; still not able to control third-party sharing
- Legal compliance - Defensive letter of the law; not actively working to protect
  - SB 54
  - SB 34
  - SB 210 License Plate Privacy Act
- Lack of transparency
- Lack of accountability
- Damage to community trust

# How has the City failed to ensure Public Access to City Governance?

- Lack of community-friendly options or expressed concern about public access during pandemic
- Repeated claims to have worked with community organizations, none of which support the ALPR program or have met officially with the PD on this issue
- Pervasive lack of respect for community members
  - Repeatedly calling opposing comments “misinformation” or “opinions”
  - Responding to community inquiries and concerns by repeating “facts” as presented by the CVPD
  - Blaming the community comments for creating fear among undocumented

# How has the City failed to provide Responsible Oversight of its ALPR program?

- No public debate prior to seeking funding and change in contract to Vigilant Solutions
- Lack of transparency regarding total costs, funding sources - not included in Report
- Lack of accountability for decisions made; remedies not adequate
- No independent oversight of CVPD
- Members of city governance groups (Chief's CAC, HRC) have not taken time to inform themselves independently about how the ALPR program works, what problems they present, etc.

# What do we want?

- Chula Vista to LIVE UP to its promise to be a Welcoming City
- Provide detailed answers to our serious questions (no glittering generalities; we want data)
- Listen to community concerns that still have not been addressed in reports, and now in the proposal
- Establish on-going INDEPENDENT, community-led oversight of the City's use of surveillance technology
- Stop the ALPR program until a process for oversight is in place
- Do NOT renew the contract with Vigilant

# What is INDEPENDENT Community-led Oversight?

- Informed Public Debate at Earliest Stage of Process
- Determination that Benefits Outweigh Costs and Concerns
- Thorough Surveillance Use Policy
- Ongoing Oversight & Accountability

**CITY COUNCIL** is responsible for policy, including funding priorities; NOT the police.

# Our community ad hoc group asks:

Will you **STOP** and LISTEN and ENGAGE -  
BEFORE further approval of ALPR surveillance  
technology?