27127 CALLE ARROYO, SUITE 1910
SAN JUAN CAPISTRANO, CA 92675
TEL (949) 388-9269
FAX (949) 388-9272
www.dpfg.com

## Memorandum

To: Curt Smith, HomeFed Village 8 LLC<br>CC: Ranie Hunter, RH Consulting Group, LLC<br>From: Peter Piller, Managing Principal

Date: January 16, 2020 (Updated)

## Re: Village 8 West - Executive Summary of Fiscal Impact Analysis

The proposed Village 8 West (the "Project") is a mixed-use development consisting of 2,334 residential units ( 1,040 single family and 1,294 multi-family units) and minimum 117,000 square feet and maximum of 300,000 square feet of commercial / office space. The site also consists of a potential elementary school site, 23.4 acres of parks and 44.3 acres of open space. The site is located south of Village 7, north of the Otay River Valley, west of Village 8 East and east of Village 4. At the request of HomeFed Village 8 LLC, the Project applicant ("Developer"), DPFG prepared a fiscal impact analysis using the City of Chula Vista's fiscal impact analysis model ("City Model") to estimate the fiscal impact of the Project on the City of Chula Vista ("City") General Fund.

For purposes of preparing the most conservative fiscal impact analysis, the model analyzes development of 2,334 residential units and no commercial/office space. The City Model was adjusted to incorporate the following assumptions:

- An increase in the assessed value of residential property due to turnover (resale) was estimated using an annual escalation factor of $3.5 \%$ which is consistent with the historical average of several recognized indices, including Case Shiller, California Association of Realtors, Federal Reserve and Zillow. Average turnover (resale) of eight (8) years was assumed for all residential units for purposes of adjusting the assessed values to calculate property taxes. In addition to typical turnover, in order to reflect similar assessed value increases over the seven-year buildout of the residential portion of the Project, the initial (year 1) home price assumption is increased by $3.5 \%$ until the initial year of sale for each unit which is then assumed to be the initial base year value. Over the next 7 years the initial base year value escalates by $2 \%$ over the prior year, consistent with California Constitution Article XIII A Section 2(b). In year eight, the initial base year value is reset (second base year value) assuming a reset of the assessed value based on an annual escalation factor of $3.5 \%$ for 8 years applied to the initial base year value. This process of resetting the base year value repeats every eight years.
- An adjustment to the fiscal impact was made to reflect a reduction in anticipated City park maintenance costs. Per negotiations with the City and the Developer, the Village 8 West Homeowners Association will be responsible for maintenance of the 7.5 acres of neighborhood
parks planned within the Project, rather than the City General Fund. Based on the estimated annual cost of $\$ 14,000$ per acre to maintain parks, the Developer is eliminating an annual cost to the City of $\$ 105,000$ which has not been considered and cannot be accounted for in City Model. This costs saving is reflected in the fiscal model summary.

The results generated by the City Model, with the adjustments outlined above, and assuming a residential only land use scenario, indicate that the Project will generate a fiscal surplus on a cumulative basis over the 20 -year projection period and annually every year except for small deficits in years 7 and 8 . The total cumulative fiscal surplus in year 20 is estimated to be approximately $\$ 2,700,000$. Additionally, when approximately $20 \%$ ( 23,400 square feet) of the minimum 117,000 square feet of commercial / office space required for the Project is developed, the Project will generate a fiscal surplus in each year, including years 7 and 8 , with a cumulative fiscal surplus in year 20 of approximately $\$ 3,500,000$.

## Exhibits:

Exhibit A: Village 8 West Summary of Adjusted Chula Vista Fiscal Impact Analysis Model
Exhibit B: City of Chula Vista Fiscal Impact Analysis Model
Exhibit C: Village 8 West Site Plan

## Exhibit A:

Village 8 West Summary of Adjusted Chula Vista Fiscal Impact Analysis Model

Village 8 West
Summary of Adjustment to Fiscal Model
Residential Only Total Project Net Revenue (Turnover based on DPFG
Turnover Model - Assumes $3.5 \%$ Escalation in new Home Pricing)
January 16, 2020
Year
Total Projected Net Rev. Before Turnover Adj. (See City Model Exhibit B)
Total Projected Net Rev. After Turnover Adj.
Cumulative Adjusted Net Revenue

| $1 \mid$ | $2 \mid$ | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | $7 \mid$ |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| $\$ 68,994$ | $\$ 102,643$ | $\$ 116,351$ | $\$ 115,392$ | $\$ 112,413$ | $(\$ 39,941)$ | $(\$ 158,231)$ |
| $\$ 68,994$ | $\$ 106,023$ | $\$ 125,588$ | $\$ 135,519$ | $\$ 149,560$ | $\$ 4,269$ | $(\$ 109,474)$ |
| $\$ 68,994$ | $\$ 175,017$ | $\$ 300,605$ | $\$ 436,124$ | $\$ 585,684$ | $\$ 589,953$ | $\$ 480,480$ |

Total Projected Net Rev. After Turnover Adj.
Benefit from HOA Maintiained Parks (a)
Adjusted Total Net Revenues
Adjusted Cumulative Net Revenue

| $\$ 68,994$ | $\$ 106,023$ | $\$ 125,588$ | $\$ 135,519$ | $\$ 149,560$ | $\$ 4,269$ | $(\$ 109,474)$ | $(\$ 142,170)$ |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| 0 | 0 | 28,000 | 28,000 | 105,000 | 105,000 | 105,000 | 105,000 |
| 68,994 | 106,023 | 153,588 | 163,519 | 254,560 | 109,269 | $(4,474)$ | $(37,170)$ |
|  | $\$ 68,994$ | $\$ 175,017$ | $\$ 328,605$ | $\$ 492,124$ | $\$ 746,684$ | $\$ 855,953$ | $\$ 851,480$ |

## Footnotes:

(a) Assumes park acreage absorption of 2 acres in year 3 and an additiona
5.5 acres in year 5. Estimated $\$ 14,000$ per acre for park maintenance.
(b) Assumes 8 year turnover with $2.00 \%$ annual escalation and $3.50 \%$
escalation when re-assessed.

Village 8 West
summary of Adjustment to Fiscal Mode
Residential Only Total Project Net Revenue (Turnover based on DPFG
Turnover Model - Assumes 3.5\% Escalation in new Home Pricing
January 16,2020
Year
Total Projected Net Rev. Before Turnover Adj. (See City Model Exhibit B)
Total Projected Net Rev. After Turnover Adj.
Cumulative Adjusted Net Revenues

| 9 | 10 | 11 | $12 \mid$ | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| $(\$ 223,668)$ | $(\$ 216,268)$ | $(\$ 226,634)$ | $(\$ 237,954)$ | $(\$ 250,277)$ | $(\$ 266,371)$ | $(\$ 283,694)$ | $(\$ 302,207)$ |
| $(\$ 95,279)$ | $(\$ 44,729)$ | $(\$ 9,661)$ | $\$ 32,609$ | $\$ 40,793$ | $\$ 37,864$ | $\$ 26,626$ | $\$ 74,460$ |
| $\$ 243,030$ | $\$ 198,302$ | $\$ 188,641$ | $\$ 221,251$ | $\$ 262,044$ | $\$ 299,908$ | $\$ 326,534$ | $\$ 400,994$ |

## otal Projected Net Rev. After Turnover Ad

enefit from HOA Maintiained Parks (a)
Adjusted Total Net Revenues
Adjusted Cumulative Net Revenues

| $(\$ 95,279)$ | $(\$ 44,729)$ | $(\$ 9,661)$ | $\$ 32,609$ | $\$ 40,793$ | $\$ 37,864$ | $\$ 26,626$ | $\$ 74,460$ |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| 105,000 | 105,000 | 105,000 | 105,000 | 105,000 | 105,000 | 105,000 | 105,000 |
| 9,721 | 60,271 | 95,339 | 137,609 | 145,793 | 142,864 | 131,626 | 179,460 |

ootnotes:
(a) Assumes park acreage absorption of 2 acres in year 3 and an additional
5.5 acres in year 5. Estimated $\$ 14,000$ per acre for park maintenance
b) Assumes 8 year turnover with $2.00 \%$ annual escalation and $3.50 \%$
escalation when re-assessed.

## Village 8 West

Summary of Adjustment to Fiscal Mode
Residential Only Total Project Net Revenue (Turnover based on DPFG
Turnover Model - Assumes $3.5 \%$ Escalation in new Home Pricing)
anuary 16,2020

| Year | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Total Projected Net Rev. Before Turnover Adj. (See City Model Exhibit B) | (\$322,015) | $(\$ 343,206)$ | $(\$ 365,841)$ | $(\$ 389,995)$ |
| Total Projected Net Rev. After Turnover Adj. | \$89,133 | \$122,302 | \$156,729 | \$199,018 |
| Cumulative Adjusted Net Revenues | \$490,127 | \$612,429 | \$769,158 | \$968,177 |
| Total Projected Net Rev. After Turnover Adj. | \$89,133 | \$122,302 | \$156,729 | \$199,018 |
| Benefit from HOA Maintiained Parks (a) | 105,000 | 105,000 | 105,000 | 105,000 |
| Adjusted Total Net Revenues | 194,133 | 227,302 | 261,729 | $\underline{ }$ 304,018 |
| Adjusted Cumulative Net Revenues | \$1,911,127 | \$2,138,429 | \$2,400,158 | \$2,704,177 |

Footnotes:
(a) Assumes park acreage absorption of 2 acres in year 3 and an additional
5.5 acres in year 5 . Estimated $\$ 14,000$ per acre for park maintenance.
(b) Assumes 8 year turnover with $2.00 \%$ annual escalation and $3.50 \%$
escalation when re-assessed.

## Exhibit B: City of Chula Vista Fiscal Impact Analysis Model





## Exhibit C: <br> Village 8 West Site Plan and Site Utilization Summary



Exhibit 2.1-Site Utilization Plan


Table 2.1 - Site Utilization Summary

Commercial and Residential

| Town Center - 18-45 du/ac |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Planning <br> Area | Gross Acres | Transect ${ }^{(1)}$ | Target Res. Units ${ }^{(2)}$ | $\underset{\text { Com'I }}{ }$ | $\underset{M_{M a x^{(2)(3)}}}{\text { Com'I }}$ |
| B | 1.2 | T-4:TC | - | 0 | 4 |
| ${ }^{(8)}$ | 7.5 | T-4:TC | 180 | 0 | 36 |
| F | 2.8 | T-4:TC | $175{ }^{(7)}$ | 10 | 10 |
| W | 2.3 | T-4:TC | See ${ }^{(7)}$ | 0 | 0 |
| H-1A-1D | 7.5 | T-4:TC | 225 | 20 | 75 |
| H-2 | 1.2 | T-4:TC | 0 | 0 | 12 |
| J | 5.5 | T-4:TC | 199 | 0 | 18 |
| L-A - L-D | 14.0 | T-4:TC | 431 | 87 | 145 |
| X | 0.7 | T-4:TC | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Subtotal | 42.7 |  | 1,210 | 117 | 300 |
| Medium-High Density Residential - 11-18 du/ac |  |  |  |  |  |
| Planning Area | Gross Acres | Transect ${ }^{(1)}$ | Target Res. Units ${ }^{(2)}$ | Com'I <br> Min. ${ }^{(2)(3)}$ | $\underset{\text { Com' }^{\text {Max }}{ }^{(2)(3)}}{ }$ |
| $D^{(8)}$ | 19.4 | T-3:NC | 234 |  |  |
| E | 5.1 | T-3:NC | 0 | Basin |  |
| I | 6.1 | T-3:NC | 84 |  |  |
| M | 8.3 | T-3:NC | 125 |  |  |
| 0 | 8.7 | T-3:NC | 120 |  |  |
| Subtotal | 47.6 |  | 563 |  |  |
| Medium Density Residential Attached/Detached - 6-11 du/ac |  |  |  |  |  |
| Planning Area | Gross Acres | Transect ${ }^{(1)}$ | Target Res. Units ${ }^{(2)}$ | $\underset{\text { Min. }}{\substack{(2)(3) \\ \text { (3) }}}$ | $\underset{\operatorname{Max}^{(2)(3)}}{\text { Com'l }^{\prime 2}}$ |
| Q | 11.1 | T-2:NG | 106 |  |  |
| U | 15.6 | T-2:NG | 127 |  |  |
| Subtotal | 26.7 |  | 233 |  |  |
| Low-Medium Density Residential Village - 3-6 du/ac |  |  |  |  |  |
| Planning Area | Gross Acres | Transect ${ }^{(1)}$ | Target Res. Units ${ }^{(2)}$ | $\underset{\text { Min. }{ }^{(2)(3)}{ }^{\prime \prime}}{ }$ | $\underset{\operatorname{Max}^{(2)(3)}}{\text { Com'l }^{\prime 2}}$ |
| N | 20.1 | T-2:NE | 117 |  |  |
| P | 25.4 | T-2:NE | 115 |  |  |
| V | 19.1 | T-2:NE | 96 |  |  |
| Subtotal | 64.6 |  | 328 |  |  |
| TOTAL | 181.6 |  | 2,334 | 300 | $K^{(3)}$ |

Public, Quasi Public, and Other

| Community Purpose Facility (CPF) ${ }^{(4)}$ |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Planning Area | GDP <br> Land Use | Gross Acres | Transect ${ }^{(1)}$ | Description |
| R-A - R-C | MH | 5.5 | SD: CPF | CPF |
| Subtotal |  | 5.5 |  |  |
| Potential School (S) Sites ${ }^{(5)}$ |  |  |  |  |
| Planning Area | GDP <br> Land Use | Gross Acres (Ac.) | Transect ${ }^{(1)}$ | Description |
| S | MH | 11.1 | T-3: NC | Elementary |
| Subtotal |  | 11.1 |  |  |
| Parks (P) |  |  |  |  |
| Planning Area | GDP <br> Land Use | Gross Acres (Ac.) | Transect ${ }^{(1)}$ | Classification |
| A | P | 15.1 | SD: P | Community |
| G-1-2 ${ }^{(9)}$ | TC | 2.8 | SD: P | Town Square |
| T | P | 5.5 | SD: P | Neighborhood |
| Subtotal |  | 23.4 |  |  |
| Open Space (OS) |  |  |  |  |
| Planning Area | $\begin{aligned} & \text { GDP } \\ & \text { Land Use } \end{aligned}$ | Gross Acres (Ac.) | Transect ${ }^{(1)}$ | Classification |
| $Y$ | OSP | 15.6 | T-1: OSP | Preserve (MSCP) |
| OS-1-8 | OS | 28.7 | T-1:0S | Open Space |
| Subtotal |  | 44.3 |  |  |
| Other |  |  |  |  |
| Planning Area | $\begin{gathered} \text { GDP } \\ \text { Land Use } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Gross Acres } \\ \text { (Ac.) } \end{gathered}$ | Transect ${ }^{(1)}$ | Description |
| Right-of-Way | NA | 34.8 | N/A | Arterials |
| Subtotal |  | 34.8 |  |  |
| TOTAL |  | 119.1 |  |  |

## SPA Total Area: 300.7 Gross Acres ${ }^{(6)}$

Notes:

1. Transects are defined in Chapter 3.
2. See Chapter 9 regarding Intensity Transfers and minimum commercial square footage requirements.
3. 17,000 sf of office and 100,000 sf of retail for the low range; 50,000 sf of office and 250,000 sf of retail for the high range (excludes Live/Work)
4. As Defined by CVMC 19.48.
5. The Elementary School site will revert to the underlying Medium-High Residential land use if it is not accepted by the school district.
6. Acreage does not include 19.2-acre San Diego Reservoir.
7. 185 DUs are authorized on Parcels F and W combined. Final unit allocation to be determined at Design Review.
8. The unit allocation between Parcels C and D may be adjusted and will be finalized during Design Review so long as the total number of combined units does not exceed a total of 414 units between Parcels C and D per Chapter 9, Implementation, Substantial Conformance.
9. Limited community-oriented retail may occur in the Town Square. The amount of retail to be determined during preparation of the Town Square Park Master Plan.
