



City of Chula Vista

Staff Report

File#: 14-0118, **Item#:** 7.

CONSIDERATION OF 1) A PRECISE PLAN (PCM-13-22) TO ALLOW A MAXIMUM HEIGHT OF 120 FEET (45 FEET MAXIMUM CURRENTLY ALLOWED) TO ACCOMMODATE A PROPOSED PARKING STRUCTURE AT THE SHARP CHULA VISTA MEDICAL CENTER CAMPUS; AND 2) A DESIGN REVIEW PERMIT (DRC13-31) TO CONSTRUCT THE PARKING STRUCTURE (This item has been continued from the April 8, 2014 meeting.)

A. ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF CHULA VISTA APPROVING A PRECISE PLAN (PCM-13-22) TO ALLOW A HEIGHT OF 120 FEET (45 MAXIMUM CURRENTLY ALLOWED) TO ACCOMMODATE A PROPOSED PARKING STRUCTURE TO BE LOCATED WITHIN THE SHARP CHULA VISTA MEDICAL CENTER CAMPUS LOCATED AT 751 MEDICAL CENTER COURT (FIRST READING)

B. RESOLUTION NO. 2014-063 OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF CHULA VISTA GRANTING A DESIGN REVIEW PERMIT (DRC13-31) FOR A PROPOSED PARKING STRUCTURE ON A SITE LOCATED AT 751 MEDICAL CENTER COURT

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Council place the ordinance on first reading and adopt the resolution.

SUMMARY

Sharp Chula Vista Medical Center (the "Applicant,") is requesting a Precise Plan (PCM) in order to increase the allowable building height from 45 feet to 120 feet within the existing campus. This increase in height would allow for the development of a new six-story (seven levels) parking structure (with associated new loop road) to be developed on the existing hospital campus (the "Project"). The project site is located at 751 Medical Center Court on the east side of Medical Center Drive north of Medical Center Court and south of Telegraph Canyon Road (see Attachment 3- Locator Map).

In addition to a Precise Plan, a Design Review Permit (DRP) is also required for the new parking structure (see Attachment 7-Proposed Site Plan). The Project is subject to the consolidated permit processing provisions pursuant to Chula Vista Municipal Code (CVMC) Section 19.14.050 (C). Under the consolidated review process, the City Council would be reviewing and acting on the PCM and DRP.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

The Development Services Director has reviewed the proposed project for compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and has determined that the project qualifies for Class 32 categorical exemption pursuant to Section 15332 (In-Fill Development Project) of the State CEQA Guidelines. Thus, no further environmental review is necessary.

BOARD/COMMISSION RECOMMENDATION

On March 12, 2014 the Planning Commission considered the Project and staff's recommendation for the Precise Plan to include the entire property on which the proposed parking structure would be developed. After hearing public testimony and discussing the proposal, the Planning Commission amended staff's recommendation in order to restrict the application of the Precise Plan to the boundaries of the proposed parking structure. The Planning Commission approved (5-1-0-1) Resolution No. PCM-13-22 recommending that the City Council approve a Precise Plan to allow a maximum building height of 120 feet (45 feet maximum currently allowed) to accommodate a proposed parking structure, to be located at the northern edge of the hospital campus. In addition, the Planning Commission provided design review comments on the Project, which they wished to pass along to the City Council (See Attachment 4 - Planning Commission Resolution and Minutes).

DISCUSSION

Existing Site Characteristics

The project site is located south of Telegraph Canyon Road, east of Medical Center Drive and north of Medical Center Court. The site is atop a knoll above surrounding residential development to the south and east. To the north is the Veterans Home and to the east are additional medical offices. The existing campus is developed with hospital towers, convalescent care, medical offices and parking.

Existing General Plan, SPA Plan Land Use Designations and Existing land uses

	General Plan	CV Municipal Code Zoning	PC District Land Use Designation	Existing Land Use
Site	Public/ Quasi-Public	COP(Administrative and Professional Office/Precise Plan overlay)	N/A	Existing Hospital Campus
North	Public/ Quasi-Public	R1H (Residential)	N/A	Veterans Home
South	Med-high Residential	Planned Community (PC)	RC(Residential Condominium)	condominiums/apartments
West	Public/ Quasi-Public Professional Office	COP(Administrative and Professional Office /Precise Plan Overlay)	N/A	Medical Offices
East	Public/Quasi-Public	COP (Administrative and Professional Office/Precise Plan overlay)	N/A	Medical Offices

File#: 14-0118, Item#: 7.

	Medium High Residential	Planned Community (PC)	(RC) Residential Condominium	Residential Condominiums
--	-------------------------	------------------------	------------------------------	--------------------------

Background

The original acute care campus was developed in 1973 with the donation of the land (project site) to start the community hospital of Chula Vista. Over the years, additional campus facilities have been added to keep pace with the health service and emergency care needs of Chula Vista and South Bay residents. The East Tower was the first major medical facility built on the campus in 1979. In 1989 the Birch Patrick Skilled Nursing Facility was built, followed by the expansion of the main hospital (West Tower) in 1991. Each of the two existing 5-story towers have a height of approximately 68 feet.

The site is zoned C-O-P (Administrative and Professional Office) with a Precise Plan (P) Modifying District. This (P) modifying district was established in order to allow flexibility in the application of development standards through the establishment of a Precise Plan, which is now being requested.

Public Comment

A community meeting was held on January 30, 2014 (please see Attachment 3- Community Meeting comments). Concern was expressed by some of the neighbors with regard to potential visual impacts created by the height and bulk of the proposed parking structure. Concern was also expressed about lighting/glare into the adjacent residential areas, as well as noise generated during construction. These concerns were generated by the resident's experience with light spillage into their neighborhoods both during construction and during operation of a newly constructed medical office/treatment facility on the Sharp Medical Center Campus. In addition, neighbors expressed concern regarding hours of construction. (Staff responses to these are discussed in the Analysis section below and in Attachment 5).

Project Description

The project proposes a Precise Plan to increase the allowable building height for the medical center campus from 45 feet to 120 feet, in order to allow the construction of a six-story (seven levels) parking garage. A new loop road would be constructed around the exterior boundaries of the campus, in order to improve existing circulation patterns, as well as provide a vehicular connection to the proposed parking structure. A Design Review permit is also required for the parking structure.

ANALYSIS:

Precise Plan

The current zoning (C-O-P) for the property (approved in January 1990) establishes a Precise Plan (P) Modifying District for the site. This P modifier provides a process to allow (through the application of a Precise Plan) future deviations from the prescribed development standards of the CO zone. Said deviations provide flexibility in the application of development standards, which become necessary due to the nature of development on the site. For example, hospitals usually contain tall

File#: 14-0118, Item#: 7.

structures such as towers, which often exceed 45 ft. At this time, building height is the only requested deviation as shown in the Precise Plan (please see Attachment 6 -Proposed Precise Plan). Pursuant to the provisions of the existing zone, a Precise Plan is required to allow a deviation in building height. The applicant has complied with the requirements of Section 19.56.042 of CVMC (Required maps and information) by providing an application submittal package, which includes site plans and elevations for the Project. Section 19.14.576 of the CVMC outlines the required findings that must be established for granting approval of a Precise Plan. Said findings and staff's response to each finding are outlined in the attached Ordinance pertaining to the requested increase in allowable building height for the proposed parking structure.

Site Plan/Layout

The new parking structure is strategically located in the center of the campus to provide additional parking for the overall campus. It is proposed to be constructed within the location of an existing surface parking lot. This central location will support the acute care facilities, as well as outpatient facilities. The parking structure will be set back 167 feet from the nearest residential property to the northeast of the project site.

The loop road will include an enhanced entryway at Medical Center Court adjacent to the hospital on the north side of the campus. The loop road then continues around to the new parking garage reconnecting with Medical Center Court to the south, improving overall vehicular circulation within the campus.

Development Standards

The parking structure is considered an ancillary use to the existing hospital campus. The height and parking standards for the C-O zone are as follows:

<u>C-O Development Standards:</u>	<u>PROPOSED for Project</u>
Building Height: 45 feet	120 feet
<u>Parking:</u> <u>Hospital-</u> 1.5 spaces per bed Hospital 243 beds=365 spaces Skilled Nursing 100 beds= <u>150 spaces</u> Subtotal (hospital) 515 spaces <u>Medical Offices-</u> 1 space per 200 square-feet 180,908 square-feet= <u>905 spaces</u>	Existing Parking 1,746 spaces Net Increase + <u>608 spaces</u>

File#: 14-0118, Item#: 7.

Total Required	1,420 spaces	Total Provided	= 2,354
----------------	--------------	----------------	---------

Building Height

As discussed previously, the proposed Precise Plan is to provide for an increase in the allowable building height limit of 45 feet. The request is to accommodate a proposed six-story (seven levels) parking structure including elevator unit and architectural appendage feature. Six of the parking levels will be above grade and one below. The top deck of the parking structure will be the same approximate height (67 ft.) as the existing hospital towers on the site. An elevator tower will project beyond the top of parking deck an additional 25 feet in height, in order to accommodate the required elevator machinery above. The top has been designed as a wind scoop to provide passive cooling for the equipment and shaft.

From an aesthetic design perspective, the tower has been designed as an architectural element, separate from the structure, and a way finding element to direct visitors to the garage from the loop road. This height allows visitors to orient themselves and locate the structure. A small steel tubing appendage will project above the elevator tower an additional 10 feet. This will result in an overall height of 102 feet.

The applicant is requesting a total height allowance of 120 feet. The additional 18 feet would give the applicant flexibility for possible future development plans, which would be subject to further reviews, if and when subsequent plans are submitted. The City has not received any plans or applications for any future development on the site, other than what is currently being proposed.

Parking

As shown in preceding table, existing parking for the campus exceeds the amount required by the CVMC. The parking garage is being constructed to respond to what the applicant perceives as a current shortage of staff, patient and public parking available to the hospital, as well as to address projected hospital needs through 2030.

Upon completion, the proposed parking structure will provide a total of 718 parking spaces and will displace an existing surface parking lot containing 117 spaces. However, at all phases of construction of the parking structure there will be sufficient parking facility-wide. A parking analysis conducted for the project shows that a total of 1,746 spaces exist facility wide, which results in surplus of 326 spaces beyond the 1,420 spaces currently required. Due to this surplus, during each phase of development, there will be more than enough parking spaces available (based upon required parking) to offset any temporary loss of parking that may occur during construction. Upon completion of the Project, there will be 2,354 parking spaces available overall.

Lighting/Noise

Lighting along the loop road will consist primarily of uplighting for the landscape vegetation being proposed. Said landscaping will also provide screening from vehicles/headlights. Lighting for the

File#: 14-0118, Item#: 7.

parking structure will be directed inward toward the structure. No light spillage is anticipated beyond the boundaries of the site. Section 19.66.100 of CVMC indicates no direct or sky-directed glare shall be permitted beyond the property line. A photometric study will be required for review and approval by the City prior to issuance of building permits to ensure compliance with the CVMC. In regard to construction noise, Section 19.68.030 of CVMC specifies that hours of construction are limited to 7 a.m. to 10 p.m. on weekdays, and from 8 a.m. to 10 p.m. on weekends.

Design Review

Chula Vista Design Manual

Chapter 3 of the The Chula Vista Design Manual stipulates design parameters that pertain to site planning, landscape architecture, architecture and signage for the project site. The Design Guidelines contain illustrations and written requirements to implement the design guidance presented therein. Some of the design guidelines also emphasize quality design, site development character and conceptual building/parking/open space relationships within the site.

Site Layout/Parking

Compatibility: (Page III-31)

The arrangement of structures, parking and circulation areas, and open spaces should recognize the particular characteristics of the site and should relate to the surrounding built environment in pattern, function, scale, character and materials. In developed areas, new projects should meet or exceed the standards of quality which have been set by surrounding development.

The parking structure has been strategically located in the center of the medical campus to afford easy circulation/access as well as creating a buffer distance from the edges of the site. The orientation of the structure itself is placed to align with the other larger scale buildings nearby. The structure itself utilizes the colors and materials consistent with the adjacent buildings on the medical campus in order to fully integrate it with the hospital.

Building Placement: (Page III-31)

Structures should be sited in a manner that will complement adjacent structures. Sites should be developed in a coordinated manner to provide ordered diversity and to avoid jumbled confusion.

As mentioned above, the new parking garage is strategically located in the center of the campus to provide additional parking to the overall campus. The central location will support the acute care facilities as well as the outpatient facilities. The first experience as one enters the new loop road or “Boulevard” is to help visitors to orient themselves. With clear circulation, the Boulevard directs traffic to the center of the campus where the parking structure is located. By physically connecting both the vehicular and pedestrian paths, the structures’ location, and directional way-finding, a simple, clear order is established for visitors.

Parking (Page III-34):

Parking which is visible from the street or other areas exposed to public view must be screened and softened by landscaping, earth berms, low screen walls, or a combination thereof.

Screening (Page III-36)

When screening is required, a combination of elements should be used including solid masonry walls, berms and landscaping. The height should be determined by the height of the material or equipment being screened.

Buffering and/or screening to reduce the visual impact of the parking structure on the neighboring residential areas will be provided primarily through the use of heavy landscaping to screen the lower floors of the parking structure. California Pepper trees will be located strategically on the slope east of the new utility loop road, between the parking structure and the residential neighborhoods to the north-northeast. These evergreen trees will grow to a range of 30' - 40' in height, and being on the slope, will do a great amount of the screening of the new parking structure. A photo-simulation has been prepared showing existing and proposed elevations (with parking structure added).

Chinese Evergreen Elms and Mexican Fan Palms will be planted close to the parking structure at the north end around the elevator tower. This planting will be two-tiered, in that the Chinese Evergreen Elms will be a broad-leafed tree (growing up to 50+'), interspersed with 15' to 30' high Mexican Fan Palms. Afghan and Canary Island Pine trees will wrap the parking structure along the east façade and down around to the south of the structure, accompanied by additional palm trees to provide accent to the parking structure. These pine trees can grow to an ultimate height of 65' or more. The balance of the parking structure will be screened from view by the existing hospital complex and medical facility.

Architecture/Design

Compatibility (Page II-37):

High quality, innovative and imaginative architecture is encouraged....The designer is expected to employ variations in form, building details and siting in order to create visual interest. In all cases, the chosen architectural style should be employed on all building elevations.

One of the first objectives in the design was to minimize the look of a 'parking garage'. By manipulating scale, color and massing, the design minimizes the appearance of the structure as a garage and allows it to become one of the integrated buildings on the campus. There are several elements of the design that create both harmony and variety in the design. The elevator tower is a subtly executed glass tower that creates a destination for visitors and serves to break down the scale of the structure. The variation of colored metal panels and colored concrete affords a difference in the planes and surfaces, breaking down the scale. The interior of the garage uses subtle hues of color to soften the impact of exposed concrete and assist in visitor wayfinding. In its entirety, the structure is designed to integrate with the structures on the medical campus.

Scale/Building façade and roof articulation (Page III-38):

File#: 14-0118, Item#: 7.

At a minimum, the height of new development should “transition” from the height of adjacent development. Also, varying the height of a building so that it appears to be divided into distinct massing elements, and/or articulating the building façade by horizontal and vertical offsets in wall planes can reduce building bulk and is strongly encouraged.

The site of the hospital campus is unique in that it is a hilltop development that rises above surrounding residential development below. A number of design features have been incorporated that minimize the bulk of the structure. The architectural design results in the visual appearance being that of two separate structures. In addition, the structure is designed to be 65% open to the surrounding environment. As a means to break down the scale, several design elements were utilized. First, to break down the longer side of the structure, the design is physically separated near the center of the long façade. Adding and ‘floating’ colored metal panels on the facades creates the appearance of two separate structures. On the west elevation, the sloped ramping is masked by horizontal metal panels to avoid the look of a utilitarian garage; making it appear like a building for people rather than cars. To create a sense of orientation and identity for visitors, the subtle glass colors of the elevator tower (beacon) are patterned into smaller scale mosaics to not only bring down the scale but to reflect the diversity of the surrounding communities, patients and visitors.

Materials and Colors (Page III-39):

Colors and materials should be consistent with the chosen architectural style and compatible with the character of surrounding development.

The color palette should be selected carefully. Subdued color combinations consisting of a limited number of colors are encouraged. Large areas of intense white color and vibrant compositions should be avoided. Variations in shade or tone can be used to enhance form and heighten interest. Colors should be used to articulate entries or other architectural features.

In order to truly integrate the design to the medical campus, subtle buff-toned hues were selected for the exterior of the parking structure. The colors were coordinated with the existing structures and use similar, subtle tones. Soft, pastel tones are integrated on the interior of the structure to assist in wayfinding but also soften the interior of the parking structure. The interior colors were selected and inspired by the plants and flowers found in the new Medicinal Garden along the Promenade (“new loop road”). Entry points are identified by two elements - the first element, low, split-faced, colored blocks, are used at the vehicular level as one gets closer to the structure - these low walls are pulled far enough away from the entry drives to afford views to and from the entry points. The second entry cues are in the form of raised colored metal panels located above each entry point. The entry panels are consistent in material and color to the colored metal panels found on the façade of the structure.

DECISION-MAKER CONFLICT

Staff has reviewed the property holdings of the City Council and has found no property holdings within 500 feet of the boundaries of the property which is the subject of this action. Staff is not independently aware, and has not been informed by any City Council member, of any other fact that may constitute a basis for a decision maker conflict of interest in this matter.

LINK TO STRATEGIC GOALS

File#: 14-0118, Item#: 7.

The City's Strategic Plan has five major goals: Operational Excellence, Economic Vitality, Healthy Community, Strong and Secure Neighborhoods and a Connected Community. The Project supports the Health Community goal as it seeks to allow the existing hospital facility to operate more efficiently to meet the needs of the Chula Vista and South Bay residents.

CURRENT YEAR FISCAL IMPACT

The application fees and processing costs are paid for by the Applicant. The project will not be fully constructed until 2016, beyond the current fiscal year.

ONGOING FISCAL IMPACT

There is no net fiscal impact associated with this Project.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Ordinance
2. Resolution
3. Locator Map
4. Planning Commission Resolution
5. Community Meeting Comments and Correspondence
6. Proposed Precise Plan
7. Proposed Site Plan
8. Ownership Disclosure Form
9. Project Plans